Benchmarks and performance indicators in the cultural sector

servicing regional needs, being both curatorially risky and of the highest professional standards, developing written criticism and curatorial skills, showcasing Australian artists, writers and curators nationally and internationally, expanding the professional skill base of Brisbane, Queensland and Australian arts practitioners while servicing the largely metropolitan membership base, etc., etc. Well, all of this is what makes the cultural sector so fundamentally crucial to our society, yet nearly all of these activities are somehow demeaned when reduced to performance measures.

In the end, they are just another tool to work with and can be useful. Just don't let them run the organisation/department/program/people.

Michael Snelling is Director of the Institute of Modern Art.

The National Library supplies copies of this article under licence from the Copyright Agency Limited (CAL). Further reproductions of this article can only be made under licence.



770000313

ABC REPORT

Maintaining the news

A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF NEWS AND CURRENT AFFAIRS SERVICES PROVIDED BY THE ABC AND THE COMMERCIAL SECTOR¹

Graeme Turner²

1.0 Introduction and Summary

This research project was commissioned by the Australian Key Centre for Cultural and Media Policy and the Australian Broadcasting Corporation. Its objective was to examine ABC news and current affairs services on radio and television in comparison with equivalent services in the commercial sector to provide evidence of the ABC's relative performance in terms of comprehensiveness, impartiality and balance. The issue of accuracy is also addressed, although the limitations of time have not enabled a comprehensive approach to evaluating the ABC's performance in this regard.

A survey of the provision of news and current affairs on radio and television in the Brisbane market was accompanied by a content analysis of a selection of news and current affairs programming from the ABC's 4QR and *The 7.30 Report*, and the commercial sector's 4BC and Channel 9's *A Current Affair*. The monitoring of this programming continued over two separate weeks, one of which incorporated the handing down of the Federal Budget.

The data supported the view that the ABC's news and current affairs services were essential, and in some cases the sole components of the community's menu of news, information and analysis of public affairs.

Among the specific conclusions drawn from the research are the following points:

- Through its various outlets 4QR, Radio National, PNN and Triple J — the ABC is the only significant provider of current affairs radio in the Brisbane market. It is the largest provider of news and it broadcasts the only wholly locally produced news bulletins.
- The ABC does not provide as much television news and current affairs as the commercial sector and there would be some community benefit in changing this situation. This is because there are significant differences in the kinds of services provided, in story choice and duration, which suggest that the ABC provides the better service. News value preferences for crime and sport dominated commercial television's story selection, while the ABC covered a greater range of topics and accorded a higher importance to the coverage of political issues. In general, the ABC was more likely to cover issues as well as events.
- In TV current affairs, there is a particularly marked difference between the story selection in A Current Affair and The 7.30 Report in that the former has largely moved away from political coverage and more conventional current affairs, and towards stories presented for entertainment value only. In this context, The 7.30 Report remains the only provider which devotes the entire program to current affairs.
- The comparison with 4BC's current affairs established that 4QR's service is conclusively more comprehensive.
- Over most of the programming surveyed, the ABC has been at least twice as successful as its commercial competitors at preserving balance in its treatment of stories which require such balance. This is evident in the proportion of balanced stories and in the high levels of 'actuality' inserts in ABC radio reports.
- Since independence of news gathering influences the quality, credibility and impartiality of the news, the ABC is better equipped than its commercial competitors to deliver high-quality, independent, accurate and impartial reports. This is borne out by the results of the survey.
- In the Budget coverage sampled, while both services performed well, the ABC's coverage was more extensive, with it devoting

almost double the proportion of its radio news bulletins to the issue. In the comparison of current affairs coverage, the ABC was also significantly more comprehensive and balanced in both radio and television.

 The survey of news and current affairs on radio and television found no evidence to support recent public claims that the ABC's programming revealed bias towards indigenous and environmental issues.

Overall, the results establish that the ABC provides the most comprehensive service for radio news and current affairs, the most independent service for radio and television news and current affairs, and the most impartial and balanced service across all programming surveyed. In some cases the differentials were so dramatic as to indicate that, without the presence of the ABC, there would be no provision of a socially responsible, comprehensive news and current affairs service to the Australian community.

2.0 Comprehensiveness: Radio

The issue of comprehensiveness is approached in two broad ways. First, the research maps the range of services provided by the ABC and the commercial sector on radio in the Brisbane market. Second, it compares the choice of stories, the duration of stories, and the selection preferences evident in the results of a two-week survey of specific news and current affairs programs broadcast by the ABC's 4QR and the commercial sector's 4BC. The methodology for this survey can be found in Appendix 1.

2.1 Provision

The aim of the first step in the research project was to establish an overview of the provision of news and current affairs programming within the Brisbane market by the ABC and commercial radio. The results demonstrated very clearly that the elimination of the current services supplied by the ABC would drastically reduce the supply of information available through news and remove current affairs altogether from radio schedules.

2.1.1 Radio News

The survey revealed that within commercial sector 4BC provides by far the greatest amount of time to news (over 18 hours per week). There is little difference between the amount of news broadcast by the next highest scoring commercial stations (4BH and 4KQ, who broadcast in excess of nine and eight hours respectively). The ABC's 4QR is the largest provider of news in the market (over 20 hours per week).

Of the nine radio stations broadcasting in Brisbane, only one commercial station (4BC) has a newsroom devoted solely to its use and even this station networks a proportion of its non-prime time news from 2UE in Sydney. The two contemporary music FM stations (B105 and Triple M) share a newsroom, QFM shares with 4BH and 4TAB relays from 4KQ. Completely locally produced news is thus absent from the commercial sector: as Table 1 indicates, all the commercial stations use locally produced composite bulletins as their major form of news.

The ABC metropolitan station, 4QR, is the sole provider of locally produced news but even so, according to the categories used in this study, it only produces one hour and 40 minutes locally per week. 4QR relies on national relays and locally produced composites for the remainder. Although there is evidence that 4QR foregrounds local stories in its composite bulletins, there is a clear need for more locally produced news than is currently supplied to the Brisbane market.

Significant is the difference between the news service provided by the commercial youth stations and the ABC's Triple J. While all three stations' bulletins are networked nationally, Triple J provides 20 per cent more air time to news than is provided by B105 and almost 30 per cent more than Triple M.

Maintaining the news

Table 1: News Radio (amount broadcast/week)

Station	Total Time/week	Comprising
B105	4 hrs 4 mins	All LPCB* (shares newsroom with Triple M)
4BC	18 hrs 55 mins	14 hrs 25.5 mins of LPCB + 4 hrs 27.5 mins of RCB from 2UE
4QR	20 hrs 50 mins	1 hr 40 mins of LP 6 hrs, 40 mins RP 12 hrs 30 mins LPCB
4KQ	8 hrs 21 mins	All LPCB
4TAB	1 hr 45 mins	All bulletins relayed from 4KQ
QFM	5 hrs 56 mins	All LPCB (Shares newsroom with 4BH)
Radio Natio	nal	6 hrs 51 mins 54 mins LP 3 hrs 57 mins RP 2 hrs LPCB
Today's Eas Listening 4	y 9 hrs 16 mins BH	All LPCB (Shares newsroom with QFM)
Triple J	5 hrs 4 mins	All composite bulletins relayed from Sydney
Triple M	3 hrs 30 mins	LPCB

* LP: locally produced. RP: relayed program.

LPCB: locally produced composite bulletin.

RCB: relayed composite bulletin.

2.1.2 Radio Current Affairs

In this area, the differences are very clear, with the ABC's metropolitan station providing almost four times the amount of current affairs programming than its only competitor, 4BC. Importantly, the vast majority of 4QR's current affairs is locally produced: 28 hours per week, from a total of 39 hours per week, is locally produced.

If one were to add to this comparison the services provided by Radio National and PNN, the disparity between the provision by the commercial sector and that by the ABC would be multiplied several times over. It is absolutely clear that the ABC — through Radio National, 4QR, PNN and Triple J — is the only significant provider of current affairs radio.

In the youth sector, neither B105 nor Triple M presents any current affairs; Triple J presents 15 hours per week and thus performs a very useful service supplying a market that is rapidly moving away from conventional news and current affairs programs.

Table 2: Current Affairs Radio

Station	Total Time/week	Comprising	
4BC	10 hrs	5 hrs LP 5 hrs RP	
4QR	39 hrs 50 mins	11 hrs 50 mins per week RP 28 hrs/week LP	
Radio Natio	onal	30 hrs 45 mins All RP	
Triple J	15 hrs	All RP	
Triple Z	15 hrs	All LP community radio	

2.2 Story Choice, Story Mix, Story Duration

The second step of the project involves the analysis of the information generated by the survey of ABC and commercial programming outlined in Appendix 1. Drawing upon this information, we can examine a number of factors across the two broadcasting sectors as represented by 4QR (ABC) and 4BC (commercial): the selection of stories by

topics, the mix of local, national and international stories selected for coverage, the average duration of stories broadcast, and the news agendas pursued in radio news and current affairs programmes. All of these factors go to the issue of comprehensiveness of service in terms of the range of stories covered, the depth of their treatment, and the sensitivity of the news values employed to contemporary social, economic, cultural and political concerns.

2.2.1 News

Some general trends emerge from the tables which are collected in Appendix 2. As Table A1 establishes, 4QR gives much greater attention to politics (17 per cent in week 1 versus 8.2 per cent, and 39.4 per cent in week 2 versus 22.5 per cent), and much less to crime and sport than 4BC. Table A2 establishes that the average story duration for 4QR is 39 seconds (week 1) and 38 seconds (week 2) per story; average story duration for 4BC is 26 seconds (week 1) and 29 seconds (week 2). Table A3 shows that the mix of stories from both outlets varies greatly over the two weeks so that it is not possible to draw conclusions about organised preferences for national or international stories, although 4QR scores lower in the international category both weeks. One significant factor, however, is the high proportion of local stories covered by 4QR in both weeks (45.2 per cent and 59.8 per cent against 4BC's 26.2 per cent and 34.2 per cent).

2.2.2 Current Affairs

In current affairs, national stories dominated both sectors' selections. 4QR was well below 4BC in local coverage but significantly above in international stories. In both weeks surveyed, 4QR ranked local stories as the least important (in terms of the percentage of the program devoted to them), while 4BC ranked international stories the lowest.

There was a dramatic disparity in the total number of stories covered by each station, however: 4BC covered 57 stories in week 1 and 56 in week 2, while 4QR covered 99 stories in week 1 and 105 stories in week 2. The disparity in volume is further amplified by the average story duration figures (Tables A5 and A6), which have 4QR at 3 mins 43 seconds (week 1) and 3 mins 30 seconds (week 2) per story and 4BC at 2 mins 19 seconds and 2 mins 29 seconds per story.

The figures here do not support any strong conclusions about differences in story mix, but do indicate that 4QR's coverage is both more extensive and detailed across the board.

2.2.3 News Agendas in Radio News and Current Affairs

The appropriateness of the stories covered in radio news and current affairs demands some comment. Major political and social issues occupied the majority of time in both weeks surveyed, with crime and sport being the other popular categories.

Given recent accusations of a bias in ABC story selection towards the environment and indigenous issues, it should be acknowledged that the ABC did give greater coverage to both these categories of story than did 4BC. However, it must also be noted that they constituted extremely minor components of the program and were far from 'dominating' programs. In all cases, it could be argued, the percentage of programming devoted to these issues is below their current social, economic, and cultural significance.

Over the two weeks, 4BC devoted an average of 0.5 per cent of its news time per week to environmental stories, no news time to indigenous issues, and no current affairs time at all to either category. 4QR devoted an average of 3.05 per cent of its news time and 5.1 per cent of its current affairs time to indigenous issues; an average of 8.35 per cent of 4QR's news and 2.2 per cent of 4QR's current affairs was devoted to environmental stories. Given the fact that environmental news at the time included the development of Port Hinchinbrook and that ATSI issues were raised by stories dealing with the Federal Budget, the appointment of Bill Hayden as a mediator over the Century Zinc mine, and statements by the Governor General about reconciliation, 4BC's ignoring of such issues seems far more questionable than the ABC's airing of them. At the very least, it is reasonable to argue that indigenous issues are not over-represented if they constitute 3-5 per cent of the national broadcaster's news and current affairs coverage, and that environmental issues are entitled to 2-8 per cent of the nation's attention.

Finally, in relation to both radio news and current affairs, it should be noted that there is very little evidence of the 'tabloidisation' that has marked television current affairs in recent years. Very little of the

programming on either commercial or ABC stations was solely entertainment based, aimed at generating audiences in the manner of prime time television.

2.2.4 Budget Coverage

The first week of the survey was the week the Budget was handed down, and provided an opportunity to see how well the two stations handled this event.

4QR devoted almost twice the proportion of its news broadcasts to the Budget (21.7 per cent) that 4BC allocated (11.8 per cent). Despite the importance of the Budget, crime stories were still the dominant topic for items in the 4BC news over the week (21 per cent). In current affairs programming, the Budget dominated both outlets, with 4BC devoting 45.7 per cent of its time to the issue and 4QR devoting 35.9 per cent. A difference emerges, however, in that 4QR concentrated on social, economic and political issues directly related to the Budget (30 per cent), arguably the most important aspects, while 4BC spent the majority of its coverage (24 per cent) on the demonstration at Parliament House. The 4QR stories made consistently greater use of 'actuality' inserts (either actual interview material placed within journalists' voice reports or full, often live, interviews with the journalist), while 4BC made use of some grabs which seem to have been taken from the ABC television coverage of the night before.

It is probably invidious to suggest which was the 'better' coverage since the coverage from both outlets was responsible and significant. 4QR's news coverage, however, was more extensive, and its story selection in current affairs more justifiable.

2.2.5 Summary

When combined with the contributions of other ABC outlets — Radio National, PNN and Triple J — the ABC is the only significant provider of current affairs radio in the Brisbane market. It is the largest provider of news and the only provider of locally produced news. The comparison with 4BC's current affairs revealed a dramatic disparity in the number of stories covered and the average story duration, establishing that the ABC service is conclusively more comprehensive. In the sample made of the Budget coverage, while both news services performed well, the ABC's coverage was more extensive, devoting

almost double the proportion of its bulletins to the issue. The survey of news and current affairs found no evidence to support recent public claims that the ABC's programming revealed bias towards indigenous and environmental issues.

3.0 Comprehensiveness: Television

3.1 Provision

As with the radio survey, the aim of this part of the research was to establish the provision of news and current affairs programming within the Brisbane market by ABC and commercial television. The results for television are different to those for radio, in that the ABC is not the largest provider of programming in either news or current affairs. With television, however, there is a significant difference between the kinds of services provided under these categories. The effects of 'tabloidisation', in particular, are relevant when we come to deal with the issues of story choice and story duration.

3.1.1 Television News

All commercial channels provide more total time for the news than the ABC. Channel 10 produces the most (12 hours per week), with Channel 2 producing 6 hours and 35 minutes per week. This may reflect differences in resources as well as in programming choices, and there may well be an inverse relation between quality and quantity in this area. There is no wholly local bulletin on any channel, all outlets relying on a mixture of locally produced composite bulletins and relayed composite bulletins.

Table 3: News Television

Channel	Total Time/week	Comprising
Ch 2	6 hrs 35 mins	3 hrs 30 mins LPCB 3 hrs 5 mins RPCB
Ch 7	8 hrs 30 mins	3 hrs 30 mins LPCB 5 hrs RPCB
Ch 9	8 hrs 40 mins	3 hrs 30 mins LPCB 5 hrs 10 mins RCB
Ch 10	12 hrs	6 hrs LPCB 6 hrs RCB
SBS	3 hrs 30 mins	RCB from Sydney

3.1.2 Television Current Affairs

In this category, Channel 9 is the largest provider at 6 hours 30 minutes per week, with Channel 2 coming second with 5 hours 40 minutes per week. Channel 7 is third, but it is significant that it broadcasts the only locally produced current affairs show in Brisbane. Channels 9, 10 and SBS rely entirely on national relays for their current affairs, Channel 7 uses relays for 1 hour 35 minutes of its output, and Channel 2 uses relayed composite programs.

Table 4: Current Affairs Television

Channel	Total Time/week	Comprising
Ch 2	5 hrs 40 mins	All RCB
Ch 7	4 hrs 5 mins	2 hrs 30 mins LP 1 hr 35 mins RP
Ch 9	6 hrs 30 mins	All RP
Ch 10	1 hr	All RP
SBS	3 hrs	All RP

3.2 Story Choice, Story Mix, Story Duration

As was the case with radio, this section draws on the information generated by the survey of ABC and commercial programming outlined in Appendix 1. Below we review a number of factors across the two broadcasting sectors as represented by comparisons between Channel 2 and Channel 9 evening news, and between *The 7.30 Report* and *A Current Affair*: the selection of stories by topics, the mix of local, national and international stories selected for coverage, the average duration of stories broadcast, and the news agendas pursued in television news and current affairs programmes. The tables for these can be found in Appendix 2.

3.2.1 Television News

A difference picked up in the radio comparison is even more marked with television: the dominance of crime stories within commercial news bulletins. Crime stories accounted for 26.3 per cent of 9 News in week 1 (as against 10.1 per cent for the Budget), and 22.6 per cent in week 2. Channel 2 ran 16.4 per cent on crime in week 1 and only 4.7 per cent in week 2. Politics consistently took up a larger proportion of the ABC bulletin than of Channel 9's news: an average of 21 per cent for the ABC over the two weeks (or 28.4 per cent if we include the Budget), against an average of 12.3 per cent (or 18.35 per cent if we include the Budget). Sport and entertainment were slightly higher in the Channel 9 bulletins, business and finance slightly higher in the Channel 2 bulletins, and the treatment of sport occupies a significantly greater proportion of television bulletins than on radio.

The figures on average story duration (Tables A5 and A6) in television news has Channel 9 producing 128 stories at 63 seconds per story in week 1, and 121 stories at 67 seconds per story in week 2. Channel 2 screens fewer stories but gives them more time, producing 123 stories at 86 seconds per story in week 1 and 114 stories at 94 seconds per story in week 2.

3.2.2 Television Current Affairs

The most startling difference between the two current affairs programs was the proportion of time devoted to politics. Over the two weeks, the average proportion of *The 7.30 Report* spent on politics if we include the Budget coverage was 61.5 per cent; the average for A

Current Affair was 18.3 per cent. If we exclude the Budget coverage, the figures are 25.5 per cent (ABC) versus 8.3 per cent (Channel 9).

Average story duration was similar, with the major difference in week 1 due to the extra Budget special run by *The 7.30 Report*. This special is also responsible for the program scoring nil in the local stories category for that week. Both channels, though, reveal the influence of networking in their strong preference for national stories.

Finally, the survey collected data on the proportion of current affairs stories which were generated by the current news agenda (Tables A7 and A8), rather than generated inhouse by the program for their entertainment value. This is in response to frequently repeated claims that commercial current affairs, in particular, no longer does what used to be considered standard current affairs — background and analysis on issues in the news. This factor goes to the comprehensiveness and the social usefulness of the service provided and is extremely revealing. Averaged over the two weeks, 28.5 per cent of A Current Affair's stories were not related to the current news agenda and must be called 'infotainment'. The 7.30 Report recorded a score of only 3.2 per cent. This is not unexpected, but is a dramatic sign of the shift in the genre of current affairs on commercial television away from the news agenda and away from political issues in particular.

3.3 News Agendas for Television News and Current Affairs

The survey highlights emerging differences in the principles of selection between the ABC and commercial news and current affairs. These differences record the commercial channels' news services moving away from politics and some social issues in order to cover crime and sport. With current affairs, the trend is both more dramatic and of greater social significance. A Current Affair is now spending almost a third of its time generating its own entertainment-based stories and could not be regarded as providing anything like comprehensive coverage of even the most limited agenda of national political, economic or social issues.

On the question raised in the earlier discussion of news agendas in radio, it is worth noting the coverage of indigenous and environmental issues within news and current affairs on television. In the period surveyed, ABC news averaged 3 per cent of its bulletin on indigenous

affairs, and 4.2 per cent on environmental issues; Channel 9 news averaged 0.5 per cent on indigenous issues and 2 per cent on environmental issues. In current affairs, Channel 2 averaged 0 per cent on indigenous affairs and 2.5 per cent on environmental issues; Channel 9 averaged 0.3 per cent on indigenous affairs and 2.1 per cent on environmental issues. These figures should put to rest any residual accusations of the privileging of these topics within the ABC, and may rather indicate the need for them to be taken more seriously within the commercial sector.

3.4 Budget Coverage

As with radio, the ABC provided a more extensive and focused coverage of the Budget on television. A total of 13.7 per cent of its news in week 1 was devoted to the Budget, with the majority of the coverage dealing directly with the Budget rather than with the demonstration outside Parliament House. Channel 9's news gave 10.1 per cent to the Budget, but the majority of this coverage was devoted to the demonstration.

In current affairs coverage, the differential is massive. A total of 72.1 per cent of the ABC's coverage was devoted to the Budget, as against 20 per cent of A Current Affair. The differing approaches to current affairs is evident in the strategies used by each program. The 7.30 Report ran extended programs on the Budget night, and on the Budget reply night (Budget night approximately 90 minutes, and the reply night, an hour). A Current Affair ran a question and answer session with a studio audience asking their opinion on the Budget, and an interview with the Treasurer. Only one of these approaches could be called comprehensive, concerned with canvassing as wide a range of opinion as possible.

3.5 Summary

The ABC does not provide as much television news and current affairs as the commercial sector and the survey suggests this should be cause for community concern. This is because there are now quite significant differences in the kinds of services provided and in story choice and duration. News value preferences for crime and sport dominated commercial television's story selection, while the ABC covered a

broader range of topics and accorded a higher importance to the coverage of politics. The coverage of events rather than of issues is emerging as a difference between the news values of commercial and ABC broadcasters.

In current affairs, there is marked difference between A Current Affair and The 7.30 Report in that the former has largely moved away from political coverage and more conventional current affairs, and towards stories presented for entertainment value only. In this context, The 7.30 Report remains the only provider which devotes virtually the entire program to current affairs.

4.0 Impartiality and Balance

Demonstrating impartiality or defending against charges of media bias are difficult tasks. Individual readings of the same news item or current affairs story can be diametrically opposed, depending on the opinions and attitudes each individual reader brings with them. In order to generate some hard evidence which will help establish the ABC's relative impartiality, two factors have been tracked through the materials generated by the comparative survey.

The first factor is the maintaining of 'balance'. A fundamental issue in the discussion of the media's representation of social and political issues is the inclusion of competing points of view. Are all interested parties given the opportunity to put their view? Competing points of view must be balanced against each other to allow the viewer or listener to form an independent judgement. The survey materials have been examined to determine the extent to which those stories which should be balanced actually are.

A second, and even more elusive, factor in maintaining the impartiality and accuracy of the news is the relative independence of the organisation producing it. In general, the ABC's institutional independence, separate both from government and from business, is a crucial attribute which continues to protect it against claims of undue influence. More specifically, the independence of the ABC's news and current affairs service derives from its maintenance of a network of foreign and regional correspondents which reduces their reliance on other news agencies. The ABC's employment of a large (but decreasing) network of local radio reporters differentiates its news-gathering structures from

those of the commercial sector. That this is a deliberate defence of the commitment to independence is evident in the ABC's declining to use AAP for domestic stories. Some comments, then, will be made about this factor as well, by examining the sources of broadcast news and current affairs.

4.1 Balance

For the purposes of this exercise, 'balance' is defined as the range of viewpoints represented in the story. If the story left out social or political viewpoints that might reasonably be expected to be covered, then the story was considered unbalanced. However, a story was considered balanced if other stories in the same bulletin provided an appropriate range of competing viewpoints, even if the story by itself was unbalanced. In news, the journalist can provide such viewpoints through direct grabs from various speakers or through indirectly quoting such opinions in their stories. In current affairs, however, it is also legitimate to regard 'devil's advocate' questioning as allowing a range of opinions to be represented.

It should be pointed out that the analysis has been extremely conservative, relying on explicit canvassing of other points of view rather than any more subtle or implicit process. Further, it is not uncommon for stories to be balanced in subsequent rather than in single bulletins. Given such considerations, the figures likely to err on the side of over-estimating the number of stories which have not been formally balanced.

Obviously, for some stories, a range of opinions is not usually required (e.g. a story saying that fire had destroyed a building; results of sporting matches, etc.). The commercial stations run a lot more 'not applicable' stories, because of their tendency to chase spot news — fires, crimes, etc. On radio, in particular, many of their stories are so short they often don't allow much more than a very brief statement of bare facts, without time for expression of competing opinions. Questions of balance only come significantly into play when journalists are critiquing or examining the processes and assumptions behind events and actions. It may be appropriate to consider the ratio of 'not applicables' as an indication of whether journalists are covering events or covering issues.

The figures for this factor can be found in Appendix 2. Tables A9-A12.

4.1.1 Radio

The following points are derived from looking at the figures which exclude the 'not applicable' stories, only tabulating stories where balance is an important issue.

With radio news, the proportion of unbalanced stories broadcast by 4BC is very high, averaging at 43.2 per cent over the two weeks. 4QR averaged 28.2 per cent. In current affairs, the pattern is repeated, with 4BC averaging 42.2 per cent and 4QR averaging 13.8 per cent.

From these figures, there is absolutely no basis for the common accusation that the ABC's news and current affairs reveal bias, since the ABC is demonstrably more committed to the pursuit of a balanced coverage than its closest commercial competitor.

4.1.2 Television

Television news across both sectors is generally more successful at balancing its stories than is radio news. An average of 24.7 per cent of applicable Channel 9 news stories were unbalanced, but again this is significantly higher than Channel 2's average score of 8.6 per cent. With current affairs, the average over the period surveyed for A Current Affair was 18.8 per cent, and for The 7.30 Report it was 1.4 per cent.

As was the case with radio, the ABC is providing a much more impartial and balanced service in television news and current affairs than its commercial competitors.

4.1.3 Summary

The ABC is performing a much more balanced and impartial role than its commercial competitors in the news and current affairs programming surveyed. Over most of the programming surveyed, the ABC has been at least twice as successful as its commercial competitors at preserving balance in its treatment of stories which require balance.

4.2 Story Source

The attribution of sources is a very murky area in media practice generally, but particularly in radio. Many commercial radio stations use BBC stories without attribution, but with permission. Indeed,

foreign-sourced stories are very difficult to detect if they are, as often happens, used as 'actuality' material within a local network report. Domestically, it has become routine for both radio and television news to borrow from key competitors' programs such as AM, PM, Face the Press and Sunday — although usually with attribution. However, in this survey we found a number of occasions where short grabs seemed to have been lifted off, for instance, The 7.30 Report's Budget special without attribution by commercial radio. In one case (3 September), the researchers are convinced that 4BC used a section from the ABC's Fran Kelly's exclusive interview with Senator Colston as an unattributed insert within a network reporter's voice report.

The tables for this factor can be found in Appendix 2, Tables A13-A17.

4.2.1 Radio

The most notable feature of the figures with radio is the high incidence of overseas agency-sourced stories for 4BC in news. Averaging just under 60 per cent, this is a high percentage. Given the level of local reports (11.8 per cent and 18.9 per cent), the possible level of independence is very low. In comparison, 4QR derives the vast majority of its stories from its own correspondents.

Finally, 4BC's current affairs depends on the host for more than half its content (averaging 58.3 per cent over the two weeks surveyed), reducing the capacity for introducing competing points of view and making minimal use of actuality (an average of 8.5 pieces of actuality per hundred news stories, compared with 4QR's 118.5 per 100 stories). In comparison, 4QR's host only dealt with an average of 19.4 per cent of the stories.

4.2.2 Television

In television news, there is a significant difference between the ABC's use of its own foreign correspondents, and that of Channel 9. Over the two weeks, an average of 13.8 per cent of Channel 9's stories were sourced to its own foreign correspondent; Channel 2 sourced 33 per cent of its stories to its own foreign correspondent. This may reflect the selection of news stories (there is a lower total number of international stories on Channel 9), but it also indicates the ABC's greater capacity to provide independent readings of foreign affairs.

With current affairs, the patterns are not systematically different over the period of the survey, with two exceptions: the total lack of any foreign correspondent contributing to A Current Affair despite the fact that the Iraq/USA fracas emerged over the survey period, and The 7.30 Report's exceptionally high score for items dealt with by the host in week 1. However, The 7.30 Report score is primarily the result of the host performing a large number of live interviews as part of the extended Budget special.

4.2.3 Talkback

Talkback was excluded from this project, but there is some published research which deals with the notion of impartiality, accuracy and objectivity and which is worth noting in the context of this report's findings. In a comparison of two talkback programs in Perth in 1984, conducted by two researchers from the University of Western Australia, followed up by several studies by Stephen Mickler in the 1990s, the ABC presenter's style was differentiated from that of the commercial talkback host by the following behaviours:

- · allowing callers to think through their arguments
- avoiding the promotion of his own point of view
- reservation in providing positive or negative feedback to the callers
- · challenging or ignoring mis-informative comments

(Mickler, p.10).

Within the context of an assessment of the comprehensiveness and impartiality of the ABC's news and current affairs program, these observations seem relevant.

4.2.4 Summary

If independence of news gathering does influence the quality and the impartiality of the news, then the ABC is much better placed than its commercial competitors to deliver high quality and impartial reports. Certainly in the area of foreign news, the capacity to generate its own reports from its own reporters insulates the ABC from the danger of simply reproducing, for instance, an American point of view by recycling grabs from CNN.

The difference is most clear in radio, where newsgathering for current affairs is only seriously performed by the ABC, but it is also increasingly clear in the lack of foreign correspondents employed by commercial television.

5.0 Accuracy

Given the time frame and resources for this project, it is not able to directly assess the accuracy of news and current affairs reporting. The only way to assess this comprehensively is by referring stories back to the sources, checking the reports with those who feature in the stories or who supplied the information.

The inclusion of information about the incorporation of 'actuality' material (Tables A17, A18), however, does provide some useful pointers to the differing levels of accuracy between the two sectors. Within radio, in particular, the use of actual interview material inserted within voice reports is regarded as a prime indicator of the quality of the news gathering, and of the accuracy and authenticity of the report. The research discovered quite large differentials in the incidence of actuality and, as noted earlier, significant questions about the unattributed sources of some material used in commercial radio.

5.1 Radio

Radio revealed the greatest difference in the incidence of actuality grabs between the commercial and ABC stations. Expressed as the number of grabs per 100 news stories, 4BC scored an average of 26 against 4QR's 56. In current affairs the disparity was gross: 14.9 for 4BC, 117 for 4QR. This must represent a major difference in the accuracy, comprehensiveness and overall quality of the services compared. While there is not a great deal of difference in the news values, there is a substantial difference in the resources devoted to covering stories and these figures should be seen in conjunction with the amount of stories 4BC covered with the host rather than with a journalist.

5.2 TV

The picture is slightly different with television. Both networks were very capable at providing actuality material for their bulletins and their current affairs programs, but Channel 9 was significantly ahead of Channel 2 in both cases. This reflects Channel 9's admirable effectiveness at gaining actuality footage, but also reflects other factors picked up earlier — their preference for covering events rather than issues and their greater use of overseas agency footage.

5.3 Summary

According to the measures adopted by this study, the ABC's use of actuality to guarantee accuracy is substantially higher than its commercial competitor in radio, and comparable with its commercial competitor in television.

6.0 Conclusion

Over the course of this year, and frequently in the past, the ABC's news and current affairs programming has been subject to repeated accusations of bias, excessive liberalism and sectarianism. While such complaints may emerge from particular interests and thus 'come with the territory', it is incumbent upon a nationally funded broadcaster to routinely survey its performance in order to assess their validity.

This project has done this by comparing the service provided by the ABC with that of its major competitor in radio and in television. When such cross-sectoral comparisons occur, they reveal differentials in provision and resources; it is not surprising that the ABC is not the largest provider of television news and current affairs. Notwithstanding this fact, the results establish that the ABC provides the most comprehensive service for radio news and for current affairs in both media; it provides the most independent service for radio and television news and current affairs; and it produces the most impartial and balanced performance across all programming surveyed. In some cases the differentials are so dramatic as to indicate that, without the presence of the ABC, there would be no provision of a socially responsible, broadly based news and current affairs service to the Australian community. In the crucial areas of radio and television current affairs, the evidence supports this conclusion overwhelmingly.

Notes

- 1 Jason Sternberg, 'Children of the Information Revolution: "Generation X" and the Future of Journalism', *CQU Working Papers in Communication and Cultural Studies*, No. 2, 1995, pp. 45-60.
- Taylor, A., Hodson, S. & Trigger, D. 'Comparison of Talk-Back Radio Presenter Styles', Department of Anthropology, University of Western Australia, July 1990; D. Trigger, 'Everyone's Agreed: The West is All You need', MIA, 75, February 1995; Stephen Mickler, 'Gambling on the First Race: A Comment on Racism and Talkback Radio — 6PR, the TAB and the WA Government', Louis St John Johnson Memorial Trust Fund, Centre For Research in Culture and Communication, Murdoch University, 1992.

Appendix 1

Methodology

There were two steps to this project. The first tabulated the total amount of news and current affairs programming available to the Brisbane market on radio and television. In producing this total, certain factors had to be considered.

- Total figures include weather and traffic reports, which are often folded into the news.
- Much of 4BC's non-prime time news service is networked from 2UE in Sydney but all of its news has been included in the total figure.
- Radio talkback has been excluded. This is partly due the scale of the task if it had been included, but it also restricts what is regarded as 'current affairs'. Figures collected reflect what stations themselves regard as 'current affairs': this excludes some magazine formats such as Channel 9's Today as well as radio talkback based around personalities' opinions, and what might be called 'light' current affairs. (There is previously published research on talkback, however, referred to in the main body of the report.)

The second step in the survey was to compare the range, comprehensiveness and impartiality of the services provided by the ABC and its primary commercial competitor over a period of two weeks. The weeks chosen included the week of the Budget (August 18–23) and a more typical news week (September 2–8), although this week did include the US attack upon Iraq which possibly skews the sample towards the treatment of international politics.

The programs chosen for the survey were:

Weekdays: Television: Weekdays: Radio

Channel 9 News 4QR 7.30-8.30am

A Current Affair noon-1pm

Channel 2 News 4BC 7.00-8.00am

The 7.30 Report noon-1pm

Weekends: Television:

Weekends: Radio

Channel 9 News

4OR noon-12.30

Channel 2 News

4BC noon-12.30

While the television comparisons in news and in current affairs are equivalent, there was some difficulty in providing an appropriate comparison for current affairs on radio. Since there are virtually no radio current affairs programs outside the ABC, the choice to survey 4BC's 7am-8am slot was guided by the view that this timeslot was the closest any commercial station came to performing the service of current affairs. It is acknowledged, however, that one has only to note the amount of time allocated to this kind of radio programming by the ABC in comparison to the commercials to appreciate the enormous disparity between their respective commitments and thus the level of resources available. It would not be fair to use this comparison alone to draw highly negative inferences about the performance of 4BC.

The survey of the programming was used to extract a number of factors:

- story duration (the length of coverage provided to each story);
- story topic (the range, variety and patterns of concentration in the choices of stories);
- story mix (the local, the national, the international);
- story source (whether it was drawn from the station's own correspondent, a network correspondent, a news agency, etc.);
- story balance (whether the story canvassed a sufficient range of competing perspectives to avoid accusations of bias);
- story's relation to the news agenda (whether it was generated as an item of news, or simply for its entertainment value).

Once implemented, the survey revealed that it was often very difficult to nominate the source of a story. Not all reports nominated whether the report was a network or a local story, and not all reports acknowledged the use of foreign agencies. The BBC, in particular, has been subject to a level of unauthorised borrowing and not all those station authorised will nominate the source during the story. Similarly, ABC television coverage of the Budget, Channel 9's Sunday interviews with politicians, and Channel 10's Face the Press all provide sound

Maintaining the news

grabs for radio which are not always acknowledged. The intention behind examining this factor is to gain some sense of the degree of independence of the news or current affairs report. We came to the view that another means of assessing this was to note the amount of 'actuality' run in the bulletin. So this factor has also been included, and it does pick up significant differences.

The research has generated detailed data on the stories presented over the periods surveyed. This data has been used to develop summary tables which compare the ABC's performance and service with that of its commercial competitors. The tables are collected in Appendix 2.

Appendix 2

TABLES

All figures in all tables are rounded off to one decimal point, and so not all figures add to an even 100 per cent.

Time Allocated for News and Current Affairs

Some notes on the story topic categories for Tables A1-A4 are required.

Given the high proportion of stories on the Budget, and the intention to focus on the coverage of this event, this category is separated from the broader category of 'politics'.

In the current affairs figures, coverage of crime has been divided into 'general crime' and 'courts' (the latter refers to issues such as John Elliott/NCA or the Supreme Court ruling that tax must be paid on interest owed on compensation payments; the former refers to issues about general policing, kidnappings, robberies, murders and so on).

'Information' covers such items as the weather, headline summaries, traffic reports, surf reports, Lotto results, John Schluter's 'Back to Basics', 'Mimi Macpherson's Whalewatch' report, and so on.

The 'comment' category refers to 'John Miller's opinion segment which takes up about 3 minutes of 4BC's midday news.

'Social issues' include health, education, child welfare and so on.

'Entertainment' includes celebrities, royalty, recreational activities and the mass media.

'Previews' refers to the amount of time previewing what will be coming up next in the programme.

'Comedy' refers to the comedy segment that ends Friday night's A Current Affair.

Table A1:

Week 1. Television and Radio News				
Week 1	4BC (% of time	4QR (% of time)	Ch 2 (% of time)	Ch 9 (% of time)
Budget	11.8	21.7	13.7	10.1
	(Demo: 4.7 Issues: 7.1)	(Demo: 5.3 Issues: 16.4)		(Demo: 5.2 Issues: 4.9)
Crime	21	13.9	16.4	26.3
Politics	8.2 (Qld: 2.6 Nat: 2.8 Int: 2.8)	17 (Qld: 5.9 Nat: 7.7 Int: 3.4)	12.8 (Qld: 2.5 Nat: 4.4 Int: 5.9)	Nat: 2.2
Social Issue	s 2.4	2.6	2.9	3.4
Business & Finance	4.1	4.2	4.1	1.7
Industrial Affairs	0.3	7.6	1.3	3
Environ- ment	0.8	4.7	3.8	3.9
Indigenous	Nil	4.4	3.4	Nil
Entertain- ment	1.6	2	3.8	6.7
Sport	20.3	13.6	23.6	24.9
Information	17.8	5.8	11.7	10
Comment	9.6	-	-	_
Others	2.1	2.6	2.5	3.1

Table A2:
Week 1. Television and Radio Current Affairs

		sion and Radi		
Week 1	4BC (% of time)	4QR (% of time)	Ch 2	Ch 9
Budget	45.7 (Demo: 24 Issues: 21.8)	35.9 (Demo: 5.8 Issues: 30)	72.1 (Demo: 9.5 Issues: 62.7	20 (Demo: 6.5 Issues: 13.5)
Crime	12.4 (Gen crime: 8.5 Courts: 3.8)	14.9 (Gen crime: 4.5 Courts: 10.4)	9.5 (Gen crime: 2 Courts: 7.4)	16.9 (Gen crime: 3.2 Courts: 13.7)
Politics	3.5 (Qld: Nil Nat: 3.2 Int: 0.4)	19.3 (Qld: 0.1 Nat: 9.1 Int: 10.1)	4.4 (Nat: 4.4)	Nil
Social Issues	0.8	2.6	5.4	30.8 (Health: 12.9 Others: 17.8)
Business & Finance	11.1	3.8	2.2	3.9
Industrial Affairs	Nil	4.1	Nil	Nil
Environ- ment	Nil	2	Nil	NiI
Indigenous	Nil	4.1	Nil	Nil
Entertain- ment	5.4	3.7	5.3	7
Sport	11.3	1.4	Nil	4.1
Information/ Previews	6.9	1.7	1	6
Comedy	Nil	Nil	Nil	1.9
Others	2.9	6.6	Nil	9.5

Table A3:
Week 2. Television and Radio News

Week 2	4BC (% of time)	4QR (% of time)	Ch 2	Ch 9
Budget	2.3 (Demo: 0.6 Issues: 1.8)	4.2 (Demo: 1.5 Issues: 2.7)	1.9 (Demo: nil Issues: 1.9)	2 (Demo: 0.9 Issues: 1)
Crime	14.5	9.9	4.7	22.6
Politics	22.5 (Qld: 6.9 Nat: 2.5 Int: 13)	39.4 (Qld: 17.2 Nat: 6.8 Int: 15.3)	29.3 (Qld: 5.8 Nat: 4.4 Int: 19.1)	17.9 (Qld: 4.2 Nat: 2.1 Int: 11.5)
Social Issues	2.9	4.6	5.8	4
Business & Finance	4.2	6.1	6.8	0.3
Industrial Affairs	6.2	9	3.9	4.8
Environ- ment	0.2	4	4.3	Nil
Indigenous	Nil	1.7	2.7	1.1
Entertain- ment	1.3	1.8	4	4.1
Sport	20.9	12.2	22.6	30.2
Information	14.7	4.6	10.6	9.2
Comment	8.9	Nil	Nil	Nil
Others	1.4	2.4	3.4	3.7

Table A4

Week 2. Television and Radio Current Affairs

Week 2	4BC (% of time)	4QR (% of time)	Ch 2	Ch 9
Budget	Nil	5.3 (Demo: 1.1 Issues: 4.2)	NiI	Nil
Crime	12.4	4.8	3.5	9.4
Politics	36.4 (Qld: 17.2 Nat: 6.4 Int: 12.9)	38.2 (Qld: 0.9 Nat: 15.1 Int: 22.2)	44.6 (Qld: Nil Nat: 18 Int: 26.7)	16.6 (Qld: Nil Nat: Nil Int: 16.6)
Social Issues	5	16.4 (Health: 8.5 Others: 7.8)	12.6 (All health)	16.7 (Health: 7.7 Others: 9)
Business & Finance	8.9	6.1	8.2	12.5
Industrial Affairs	1.4	3.4	5.9	5.2
Environ- ment	Nil	2.4	5.1	4.3
Indigenous	Nil	5.8	Nil	0.7
Entertain- ment	9.2	9.4	4.4	Nil
Sport	15.7	3.9	3.8	4.1
Information	9	2	1.2	8.2
Comedy	Nil	Nil	Nil	2.1
Others	2	2.4	10.7 (Shooters 5.6 (Science 5.1)	20.3

Table A5:
Week 1. Average Story Duration (rounded to the nearest second)

Station	News	Current Affairs
4BC	297 stories at 26 secs/story	57 stories at 2 min 19 secs/story
4QR	233 stories at 39 secs/story	99 stories at 3 min 43 secs/story
Ch 9	128 stories at 63 secs/story	22 stories at 4 min 40 secs/story
Ch 2	123 stories at 86 secs/story	40 stories at 5 min 45 secs/story

Table A6:
Week 2. Average Story Duration (rounded to nearest second)

Station	News	Current Affairs
4BC	280 stories at 29 secs/story	56 stories at 2 min 29 secs/story
4QR	238 stories at 38 secs/story	105 stories at 3 min 30 secs/story
Ch 9	121 stories at 67 secs/story	20 stories at 5 min 1 sec/story
Ch 2	114 stories at 94 secs/story	27 stories at 5 min 13 secs/story

NB: For the tables on average story duration, story mix, story source, balance, actuality and infotainment/current affairs, the figures refer to current affairs only (i.e. not information, previews, comment or comedy).

NEWS AGENDAS OF CURRENT AFFAIRS PROGRAMS

Table A7:

Week 1. Percentage of Stories Generated from News Agenda

	News	Infotainment
4BC	91.2	8.8
ABC	93.9	6.1
A Current Affair	72.7	27.3
7.30 Report	97.5	2.5

Table A8:

Week 2. Percentage of Stories Generated from News Agenda

Station	News	Infotainment
4BC	91.1	8.9
ABC	96.2	3.8
A Current Affair	70	30
7.30 Report	96.3	3.7

NB: It is worth noting that the infotainment figure for *A Current Affair* would be appreciably higher if it included information, preview and comedy segments as well.

Table A9:

Week 1. Balanced vs. Unbalanced News Stories (% number of stories)

The percentages for balanced/unbalanced only (i.e. if you subtracted all the 'not applicables' and considered only the balanced and unbalanced stories) are in square brackets.

Station	Balanced	Unbalanced	Not applicable
4BC	14.1 [60.9]	9.1 [39.1]	76.8
4QR	37.8 [71]	15.4 [29]	109
Ch 9	18.8 [70.6]	7.8 [29.4]	73.4
Ch 2	30.9 [88.4]	4.1 [11.6]	65

Table A10:

Week 1. Balanced vs. Unbalanced Current Affairs Stories

Station	Balanced	Unbalanced	Not applicable
4BC	28.1 [48.5]	29.8 [51.5]	42.1
4QR	60.6 [82.2]	13.1 [17.8]	26.3
Ch 9	45.5 [62.5]	27.3 [37.5]	27.3
Ch 2	85 [97.1]	2.5 [2.9]	12.5

Table A11:

Week 2. Balanced vs. Unbalanced News Stories

Station	Balanced	Unbalanced	Not applicable
4BC	10.7 [52.6]	9.6 [47.4]	79.6
4QR	33.2 [72.5]	12.6 [27.5]	54.2
Ch 9	19.8 [80]	5 [20]	75.2
Ch 2	43.9 [94.3]	2.6 [5.7]	53.5

Table A12:

Week 2. Balanced vs. Unbalanced Current Affairs Stories

Station	Balanced	Unbalanced	Not applicable
4BC	25 [66.7]	12.5 [33.3]	62.5
4QR	61 [90.1]	6.7 [9.9]	32.4
Ch 9	50 [90.9]	5 [9.1]	45
Ch 2	81.5 [100]	[Nil] [Nil]	18.5

Story Source

In the group of tables which follows, we distinguish between the identifiable sources for news and current affairs stories. News items are divided into local, network, foreign, 'others' (which refers to an overseas news agency) and 'none', which indicates that it is impossible to attribute a source. Current affairs items have the additional item of 'host', for those stories dealt with directly by the host as a piece to camera or an interview, and the 'none' category is not applicable.

It has occasionally been necessary to make judgements about story sources which are based on the use of actuality inserts. Generally, it has been assumed that all actuality coming from a local source is the product of the efforts of a local journalist and that all actuality coming from national sources has been produced by a network journalist. However, because of the tendency for some journalists to use international actuality without attribution, any actuality not accompanied by a voice report is classified under the 'None' category to signify the impossibility of legitimately nominating the source.

Table A13:
Week 1. Story Source for News (as a % of total no. stories)

Station	Local	Network	Foreign Corresp.	None	Others
4BC	11.8	13.8	8.4	62.6	3.4
4QR	39.5	27.9	9	21	2.6
Ch 9	37.5	19.5	4.7	28.1	10.2
Ch 2	23.6	31.7	16.3	22.8	5.6

Table A14:
Week 1. Story Source for Current Affairs

Station	Local	Network	Foreign Corresp.	Host	Others
4BC	15.8	14	-	63.1	7
4QR	10.1	54.5	21.2	12.1	2
Ch 9	9.1	68.2	_	22.7	-
Ch 2	5	42.5	-	52.5	-

Table A15:
Week 2. Story Source for News (as a % of total no. stories)

Station	Local	Network	Foreign Corresp.	None	Others
4BC	18.9	7.5	9.6	58.2	5.7
4QR	50.8	10.5	9.7	25.2	3.8
Ch 9	38.8	19	9.1	29.8	3.3
Ch 2	32.5	28.1	16.7	18.4	4.4

Table A16:
Week 2. Story Source for Current Affairs

Station	Local	Network	Foreign Corresp.	Host	Others
4BC	28.6	3.6	5.3	55.4	7.1
4QR	13.3	47.6	11.4	26.7	1
Ch 9	10	65	-	20	5
Ch 2	3.7	63	11.1	18.5	3.7

Table A17:

Week 1. Amount of Actuality in News Bulletins & Current Affairs Programmes

Total number of grabs of actuality is the first figure; the number of grabs heard per 100 stories is in brackets.

	News	Current Affairs
4BC	73 (i.e. 25 pieces of actuality/100 news stories)	7 (i.e. 12 pieces of actuality/100 stories)
4QR	143 (i.e. 61 pieces of actuality/100 news stories)	123 (i.e. 124 pieces of actuality/100 stories)
Ch 9	200 (i.e. 163 pieces of actuality/100 news stories)	88** (i.e. 400 pieces of actuality/100 stories)
Ch 2	180 (i.e. 141/100 news stories)	80 (i.e. 200 pieces of actuality/100 stories)

^{**(}This figure is high because A Current Affair hosted a Q&A with the audience the night after the Budget to check their reaction. In that one segment, fourteen people spoke.)

Table A18:

Week 2. Amount of Actuality in News Bulletins & Current Affairs Programmes

	News	Current Affairs
4BC	77 (27/100 stories)	10 (17.9/100 stories)
4QR	125 (52/100 stories)	116 (110/100 stories)
Ch 9	194 (170/100 stories)	92 (460/100 stories)
Ch 2	172 (142/100 stories)	78 (289/100 stories)